

# Fictionalization of Nonfiction in Benazir Bhutto's Daughter of the East: An Autobiography

Asif Ali \*, Dr. Imran Hayat \*\*, Dr. Muhammad Sajjad Malik \*\*\*

\* Department of English Language and Literature, The University of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan,

\*\* Lecturer, Department of History & Arts, Division of Arts and Social Sciences, University of Education, Lower Mall Campus, Lahore, Pakistan  
<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0647-0989>

\*\*\* Assistant Professor, Department of History & Arts, Division of Arts and Social Sciences University of Education, Lower Mall Campus, Lahore, Pakistan, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0883-5913>

## Abstract

This article investigates Benazir Bhutto's *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography* in the paradigm of fictional autobiography. Louis A. Renza's theory "The Veto of the Imagination: A Theory of Autobiography" reveals the intergenre nature of autobiography, an indeterminate combination of truth (fact) and fiction based on self-invention. The research aims to examine the elusiveness of autobiography, as a literary genre, its fictive composition and the author's political motives for pursuing the narrative design of fiction writing. Autobiography embraces the devices of skilled narration (elaboration and narrative freedom) and eludes accuracy, impartiality and inclusiveness. Bhutto creatively narrates her past events, family history and religious and political ideologies without considering the limitations of nonfiction. The study finds that Bhutto manipulates the concepts of death, honour, and democracy into the idea of martyrdom for the faith. Life writing is paradoxically structured on a fictionalization of nonfiction instead of a factual representation of the writer's memories. This praxis of experimentation with the literary form renders the autobiography a fictional outlook, the conflation of fiction and nonfiction. *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography* is a distinctive mode of self-referential expression which converts its author's lived life into an elaborately constructed project of fictional past, an autofiction. The autobiography is a fragmentary, arbitrary and incomplete record of the autobiographer's life.

## Index Terms

Autobiography, nonfiction, honor, fiction, martyrdom, death,

## I. INTRODUCTION

The former Prime Minister of Pakistan Bhutto's autobiography, *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography*, reflects itself as an indeterminate combination of truth and fiction, a full-fledged literary composition, opposite to the prevalent perception that the autobiographical narrative is an actual mirror of the autobiographer's life. Nevertheless, Bhutto claims that many of her father's close friends encouraged her to

write about her father's populist government and its overthrow, trial and execution, the exile of his followers and her unlawful imprisonment and persecution. She believes what is not recorded is not remembered. Although writing the autobiography was an awful experience to relive the painful memories yet it was cathartic to come to terms with her traumatic and inescapable past (3). Autobiographical writing is pursued to narrate the factual orientation of autobiographical references; however, Bhutto does not objectively portray her past experiences. She transforms empirical facts into artefacts to build the purpose-oriented pattern of autobiography and uses language dominated by historico-political discourse to distort facts about her life and interpret the lived life as an interdisciplinary phenomenon, the consciousness of both present and past. Hence, the autobiography like creative fiction or novel bears the employment of fictional techniques of self-invention, elaboration, plot and mythos like a story with a beginning, middle and end, and mythmaking (a struggle of good against evil).

Autobiography is not a genre of nonfiction literature but an elusive combination of truth and fiction. In his essay "The Veto of the Imagination: A Theory of Autobiography", Louis A. Renza theorizes that autobiography, because of the circular explanations of its being, entails an exceptional act of fictionalization which includes the autobiographer's subjective placement of life events. The autobiographer employs a literary mode of fiction writing to penetrate his imaginative conception into personal history. This involvement of fiction in the genre of nonfiction depicts autobiographical writing as a fusion of fact and fiction (268-70). The writer adopts imaginative strategies to plot the life-as-lived into the life-as-to-be-written in the autobiographical project (Eakin 69). The manifestation of these fictional elements reveals that an autobiographer intentionally employs the methodology of fiction writing and avoids constructing this enterprise on the immediate requirements (accuracy, transparency and verifiability) of nonfictional discourse.

The abrogation of the genre of autobiography proffers the overlapping nature of fiction and nonfiction that every autobiography carries fiction in it as every novel has some autobiographical fiction. To achieve the goals of

autobiographical writing, the writer attempts to order his past events in literary form. Subsequently, the whole project is undermined and the formal identity of autobiography is likely to be unstable (Renza 279-80). Bhutto underestimates the truism of the life references, subjected to extrinsic verification, through rhetorical justifications and ideological assertions and renders literariness to the autobiographical narrative. She embraces the pattern of imaginative fiction to infuse religious and cultural history into life writing instead of her private past. Opposite to the autobiographer's claim of the veracity of the life references, the fictionalization of the genre of nonfiction is an act of divorce between the writing self and its textual rendition.

The writing of an autobiography is pursued to straighten the record of one's already misunderstood life. An autobiographer finds it difficult to factually narrate the lived life without adding myths and stories to solidify its literariness. Despite his focus on the accurate depiction of facts, he depends upon the imagination to explore his past for the justifications of his actions. Thus, the writer lapses into self-invention and overlooks the fictional embellishments (myths, self-invention and elaboration) in the autobiography. In his book *Fictions in Autobiography: Studies in the Art of Self-Invention*, John Paul Eakin states the presence and the significance of fiction in life writing, "Fictions and the fiction-making process are a central constituent of the truth of any life as it is lived and of any art devoted to the presentation of that life" (3). While following the literary standard of fiction writing, the writer allows fiction to prevail over facts. This fictional nature of autobiography reveals the gaps, contradictions and manipulations which hinder the factual projection of autobiographical references.

The maltreatment of autobiography as a fictional act creates a gap between past and present. An autobiographer attempts to bridge this gap by seeking a new air of old memories and by introducing them into the proleptic course of the narrative. A fiction-prone autobiographer tries to situate his past efficiently and draws only representable images out of it. According to Renza, an autobiographer crafts his past through his present by inspiring meaningless data with interpretation, direction and suggestiveness. The *Autobiography of Malcolm X*, in which he narrates only the oppressive white supremacy and the victimization of blacks in then-present America, is all but Malcolm X's present-oriented past that portrays his self-expression as an amalgam of fact and fiction (291). Thus, the author's own mental experiences sacrifice his past to a secondary role that the autobiographical project is composed in the limited perspective of the author's present.

Autobiography as a genre goes beyond the fiction/nonfiction binary perspective. Autobiography, for Sarah Suh, is placed between the realms of "not-exactly-nonfiction" and "not-exactly-fiction" (7). The critics of autobiography find it hard within a literary text to determine what is autobiographical and what is not. The text of *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography* projects itself on its present. It reflects the style of fiction writing built on fictional elements like characterization, action and setting. Bhutto's claim of objective representation and her pursuance of the pattern of fiction writing is a piece of

evidence for the thesis that her autobiographical project is a product of imagination. This autobiography invites the reader to supplement its world in the light of his experiences as a valid and truthful document. It is a kind of deliberated fiction. Keeping in view the structure and genre of the text, it raises questions about whether it is an unstated combination of fact and fiction whether it is based essentially on fact rather than self-invention and if it is a nonfictional narrative designed and based on the literary pattern.

The paper investigates the fictionalization of nonfiction in Bhutto's autobiography contrary to James Cox's thesis that autobiography is a factual orientation of one's lived experiences (254) and that autobiography is not a nonfictional and neutral rendition of facts but a charged and condensed narrative elaborately projecting socially dramatic situations and periods of revolution. Following the literary tradition of pursuing the teleological pattern, the autobiographer endeavours to order his past events into a story as prose fiction (Renza 281). Bhutto views her life in the socio-religious quotient of success or failure and constitutes her autobiographical self through creative mythology, the embellished redefinition of her social, political and family life. Bhutto has more than sufficient sensational facts which provide her good ground to mythologize her past events. Suvorova narrates that Bhutto's life story contains the mythologemes of Electra and Antigone (vengeance for her father and her brother) and flabbergasting vicissitude that convey mythic and literary scenes to the reader's mind (94-95). Bhutto mythologizes the deaths of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto (her father), Shah Nawaz Bhutto (her brother) and the subsequent imprisonment of her mother (Nusrat Bhutto) and herself as a re-enactment of the Karbala tragedy during the Zia regime (251). This nature of the prima facie autobiography is neither fiction nor nonfiction not even a combination of the two rather it serves as a unique mode of self-referential expression, an arbitrary rendition of life events.

## II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

In her article "Ethnicity in South Asia: India and Pakistan: A Comparative Study with Special Reference to Sind and Assam", Das (the researcher) construes ethnicity in Sindh as a feeling of detachment from the centre (Islamabad). It is a particular group of people who hold distinctive cultural and economic interests (159). She accuses Bhutto serves her political pursuit of attaining populist support against Gen. Zia regime (1978-88) by promoting ethnic upheavals and calls for the cultural, political and economic autonomy of Sindh (159-60). Renza says, "A spirit of anarchism thus haunts the autobiographical act" (290) and the autobiographer propagates rebellion and brings disorder to society. Bhutto manoeuvres the ethnic divide and claims that Sindhis flourished economically by securing government jobs and provincial quotas in universities and factories during the government of former Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto (1973-77). Nonetheless, the Zia regime reversed all the developments and victimized Sindhis, underhandedly allotted the arable land of poor Sindhi peasants to the military officers, unlawfully grabbed the revenue of the Sindhi port and entirely overturned the economic prosperity of

Sindhis (199). Bhutto as a fiction-prone autobiographer places her life events, the sum of the historical narrative and its ethnic interpretation as a seamless fabric entwined with perception, consciousness and memories.

An autobiographical narrative is fictionalized through silhouette images to misrepresent historical facts and contents serving the autobiographer's future goals. Das contends that Bhutto incites the Sindhi people against the central government and maligns the Punjabis people for the deprivations of the province in her autobiography. Muhajir, Pathan and the Punjabi population seized the business occupation, grabbed the lands as a growing workforce and tried to substitute the Sindhi language with the Urdu language in Karachi (166). It means the non-Sindhi people downplayed the local Sindhis culturally, economically and socially in their home province. Bhutto manipulates the countrywide ethnic riots of 1983 and biasedly reports the nation-wide oppression as an anti-Sindh (Das 162). The Zia regime killed eight hundred men and molested numerous women to suppress the rebellion and flashed back the dark memories of the military vindictiveness (1971) in Bangladesh (Bhutto 206). The overstated ethnic interpretation of historical events, for Gusdorf, seems as "A single [autobiographical] acquiescence attempts to justify the venture of action or the venture of writing" (48). The preterit and purposefully orchestrated representation of history spread the feeling of hatred and anarchy.

The problem of self-cognitive dilemma about the factual conception of her private past per se her authorial prerogative of choosing truth or fiction disturbs the writing performance of the autobiographer. The autobiographer, for Renza, actively negotiates the inclusion of literary themes and ideas and the omission of facts. Autobiography loses its essayistic disposition to non-autobiographical truth or falsity (270). Bhutto prioritizes the literary design to the transparent orientation of her past and orders her life-as-lived into life-as-to-be-written. Monnier investigates why women prefer nonfiction for their life writings in her research, "A Thematic Analysis of Three Women Elect: Their Life Stories Via Autobiography". This study covers the thematic analysis of Daughter of the East. Monnier's research suggests that the process of autobiographical writing of women creates an exclusive pattern which portrays their images as the oppressed. Bhutto views her struggle and achievement in the theoretical paradigm of western feminism and claims that her success as a female political leader is a symbolic effort that means if one woman can achieve her goal, the other fellow women, with determination and courage, can do the same (2). Contrary to the essence of the theory of feminism, Bhutto's feminist position on her successful career as a popular female political leader because of her father, another person (a term used by De Beauvoir), reveals the contradictions and gaps in the imaginative conception of the autobiographical reality.

The fictionalized autobiographical text is composed of a story based on the author's life and postulates a new world composed of literary setting, characters and action. The definitive and factual representation of the past is buried in narrative abeyance as an unravished bride of imagination. Khuhro and

Soomro aim to analyze Benazir Bhutto's politics, policies and struggle during the MRD movement (Movement for the Restoration of Democracy 1983) and how bravely she struggled against the Zia regime to achieve equal rights for her people and restore democracy to her country in their article "The Role of Benazir Bhutto in the Movement for the Restoration of Democracy: An Analysis" (274). The death of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was a great tragedy for the Bhutto family and the Pakistani nation. It created a difficult situation for Benazir Bhutto and she remained ten months in detention and about five years in jail during the Zia regime (Khuhro and Soomro 276). Bhutto pursued the mission of her father, made collaboration with other political parties and revived democracy in Pakistan (274). Contrary to the findings of Khuhro and Soomro, Bhutto's treatment of her lived life as a story in the teleological pattern of writing falls in the structural binary of viewing the past as success/failure and she under the privilege of her authorial power wins against Zia regime.

This fictional nature of autobiography reveals the gaps, contradictions and manipulations which hinder the factual projection of autobiographical references. Amina Yaqin investigates Bhutto's attempt for identity formation and its conceptual guidance from both eastern and western modes of feminism which realistically stand in opposition to each other in her article "Autobiography and Muslim Women's Lives" (171). A feminist autobiography generally reflects the themes of illiteracy, struggle against patriarchy, gender discrimination, honour killing and child marriage issues. Although Bhutto diplomatically builds the narrative of feminist identity and challenges stereotypical notions of female identity in a Muslim state yet she does not break with the society's normative ideas (172). Bhutto self-consciously challenges the conventional notions about women, countering the grand narrative of religious and patriarchal discourse, an orthodox-Islamic representation of women (Yaqin 173). In opposition to her feminist position, she fundamentally conforms to the societal law, "for the protection of its [women's] honour, [Bhutto clan] keeps its women in Purdah and the four walls" (Bhutto 28). However, she contemptuously mentions the Islamic code of male and female gatherings: "women are not safe with men" during the Zia regime (Bhutto 262). She wears a thin veil of a Muslim progressive woman and subjectively explores the thin line between these two streams.

In their article "The Personal is Political: A Feministic Analysis of Pakistani Political Autogynographies", Abbas and Asma Kashif Shahzad analyze Benazir Bhutto's Daughter of the East: An Autobiography and Fatima Bhutto's Songs of Blood and Sword: A Daughter's Memoir to investigate how the autobiographers from Pakistani elite become politically conscious while narrating their fathers' stories in their autobiographies. These autobiographies have shared characteristics because both autobiographers come from the Bhutto family. The autobiographical motives of Benazir Bhutto and Fatima Bhutto are interrelated as their self-narratives have been written after the political assassinations of their fathers. The depiction of the fathers' life in these life writings reveals that the autobiographers predominantly devote their books to the defence of the vulnerable images of their fathers. Moreover, the word "daughter" in the title

of these autobiographies signifies the idea of filiation. The narrators reflect their political consciousness by justifying their fathers' political ventures and how the national politics (of Pakistan) and its implications affected their familial lives. The paper highlights how Benazir Bhutto challenges the patriarchal stereotypes of outdated politics that the adoption of a political career requires sacrifice. She emphasizes that the daughters, like sons, can also inherit the political legacy of their fathers. Nevertheless, Fatima Bhutto accuses Benazir Bhutto that she usurped her father's legacy and flouting her political principles (12-15). It infers that both Benazir Bhutto and Fatima Bhutto seem gender-sensitive even though they defend their fathers for political reasons.

### III. ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

Daughter of the East is a fictionalization of nonfiction projected in purposefully planned and fictionally designed autobiographical writing. An autobiographer, for Renza, inspires meaningless data with interpretation, direction and suggestiveness to achieve his present-oriented goals (271) and eludes some restrictions like inclusiveness, accuracy and impartiality. Bhutto says, "This is my story, events as I saw them, felt them, reacted to them" (3). Roland Barthes postulates the autobiographer's isolation from the life-as-lived, "The one who speaks [in the narrative] is not the one who writes and the one who writes is not the one who is" (156). Bhutto's claim of personal interpretation and representation of her life into a story is a piece of evidence for the thesis that the autobiographer does not objectively entrust his/her private past to the reader and thrusts his/her intuitively constructed life narrative which reveals the sketchy rather an arbitrary rendition of the autobiographical text. The fictionalization of nonfiction in the guise of mythmaking stems from viewing her father's death as Shahadat (the martyrdom for the faith) in the martyr cult of Shiite Imams, and her mission of the restoration of democracy as a desire for Shahadat (martyrdom), grows into glorifying the honour of the Bhutto family as an absolute family tradition and pinnacles at sketching her life narrative as the self-portrait of oppression.

#### a) Bhutto's Mythmaking: A Struggle of Good against Evil

Bruss says, "This [autobiography] is the myth and the effortless magic of something that happens of its own accord" (303). During the formulation of the autobiographical self, creative mythology is explicitly formed by the narrator (autobiographer). The appearance of autobiography in a mythological narrative implies a new spiritual revolution: the artist and the model coincide; the historian tackles himself as an object. That is to say, he considers himself a great person, worthy of men's remembrance even though he is only a more or less obscure intellectual. The fiction-prone autobiography follows the pattern of a mythological narrative in which the protagonist and the antagonist symbolize good and evil. According to Suvorova, the plot construction of Bhutto's autobiography follows the Legend of the Holy Grail by including ordeals, feats and exile, which lends the axiological modality to the story and convinces the reader of the moral

superiority of the protagonist as a champion of universal values (92). The myth may stagnantly cast magical spells if the autobiographer belongs to a superstitious culture of magical incantatory. Bhutto converts her life into a tale which can be viewed as an example of myth-making. The pursuance of the imaginative mode of autobiographical writing instead of the descriptive mode proves James Olney's thesis that both poetry and autobiography are the definitions of the writing self (44), the desideratum of the fictional elements of elaboration and self-invention.

Daughter of the East: An Autobiography comprises certain absolutism of good and evil. Autobiography finds the possibility of its creation often in metaphysical settings. According to Gusdorf, perhaps humanity, too, might have emerged from the mythic ethos of magical and metaphysical teachings (30). Bhutto portrays the Zia regime's monstrous tyranny and dictatorship as an era of a usurper and quasi-mythological dragon, the death of her father as a medieval execution and her imprisonment, oppression and exile as a struggle against evil. She believes that Zia ul Haq unlawfully executed her father. She writes that Zia ul Haq suddenly died in an aircraft accident which marks her father's innocence and righteousness and the divine retribution for her father's execution (184). Later, her victorious return to her people in a halo of success over evil and the notion of salvation and emancipation convert her life story into a narrative of good and evil and lend her life writing a universal pattern of the eventual and durable triumph of those who patiently swallow the maltreatment and exploitation at the hands of a potential tyrant.

Bhutto underwent extraordinary trials and sensational facts to avail herself of the good ground to mythologize her autobiographical writing project. Suvorova says that Bhutto employs the Greek mythologemes of Electra and Antigone (vengeance for her father and her brother) and the astonishing vicissitude which reminds the reader of the ancient fate (94). The amenable chronological order of autobiographical references and its alignment with the pattern of creative fiction in the name of essayistic disposition of the nonfiction literature appears elusive to the reader and does not conform to the writer's purposeful imperatives of autobiographical narrative. The literary history of autobiographical writing provides room for distinct mythology framed on the writer's chosen themes of the lived life (Gusdorf 48). During the past years, Bhutto does not remain certain of cause and effect and myth and miracle. However, while narrating her life history, she converts her life into a self-portrait of oppression. She distances herself from her lived past (factual past), resembling real-life and produces a purposeful piece of self-invention.

Bhutto correlates the personal and political incidents of her life with the tragic incident of the Karbala and pursues the coherently mythological expression of her entire destiny. She narrates the tragic event in Muslim history: the martyrdom of Hazrat Imam Hussein (R.A.), the Prophet's (PBUH) grandson, and a group of his close relatives and associates in a battle against the army of Yazid I. Thus, Shiites consider Yazid as a tyrant. She asserts, "Every day is Ashura and every land is

Karbala” (31). She advises that every Muslim must be ready to lay down his life for the faith in the continuation of the Karbala tragedy. The martyrdom of Imam Hussein (R.A.) is widely interpreted as a struggle against injustice or oppression. Hazrat Hussein (R.A.) was not a mere commander and a martyr but an Imam and a rightful heir to the Prophet (PBUH) (31). She firmly believes that the Battle of Karbala was between the forces of good and evil: Hazrat Hussein (R.A.) as good and Yazid as evil.

Bhutto renders the mythologeme of martyrdom in the Shiite cult of Islam that Shia Muslims believe that every generation has to offer the sacrifice like that of the Karbala tragedy which occurred to the holy family of Hazrat Imam Hussein (R.A.). The recurrence of the Karbala tragedy flows down to every generation of Muslims and it is a tribute to the family of Hazrat Muhammad (PBUH). The people of Pakistan consider the persecution of her family members and her followers as a re-enactment of the Karbala tragedy. Zia spared neither Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, his wife and his sons nor his followers. Like the followers of Imam Hussein (R.A.), the faith of the Bhutto family and its followers never shook. As Bhutto stopped in the doorway of Al-Murtaza (Bhutto House Karachi), a woman’s voice echoed above the wails in the house, symbolizing the reenactment of the tragedy at Karbala. She keened in the Sindhi cadence, “See, see, Benazir. She has come with the body of her brother. Feel the grief of the sister. Remember Zeinab, going to the court of Yazid” (251).

The fictionalization of judicial trial and political struggle of the life narrative of Bhutto infers that the Zia regime has been textually portrayed as evil and despotic rule flashing back to the victimization and persecution of the holy family (The family of the Holy Prophet). The intended representation of the autobiographer’s past, for Gusdorf, is suspended and kept untold in the fictional autobiographical discourse (21) and the autobiographer acquires a new identity composed of the mythologized setting, characters and action. Bhutto develops a mythological parallel between the holy family and the Bhutto family, which does not intend to reflect any autobiographical data and is the fictionalization of nonfiction, and becomes the historian of herself and produces her portrait depicting only external appearance (the representable past events).

Bhutto interprets her father’s death sentence as an instant effect to claim him a martyr and Sufi saint. Bhutto records the miracles at the death of her father, “A crippled boy walks. A barren woman delivers a son. Thousands [of devotees] have made the pilgrimage to our family graveyard to hold a rose petal or a piece of mud from my father’s grave on their tongues while they pray” (134). These miraculous incidents and supernatural elements hold no extrinsic verification, so they are widely grasped as fictional elements. The autobiography itself exposes the autobiographer’s attempt of mythologizing his life story (Gusdorf 48). Such mythical and magical elements do not have transparency and proof of their facticity and reflect fictional embellishments in the autobiography. The mythmaking beyond the autobiographical project insulates Bhutto and her father from other fellow citizens and goes as mysticism. This profanation of

personal memory by Bhutto spoils the factual account of her autobiographical project.

The basic objective of autobiographical writing is to narrate the autobiographer’s past events and experiences with referential accuracy and to straighten the record of his already misunderstood life. However, the fiction-autobiographer immerses himself into self-forgetfulness through the discursive act of writing, fictional intentionality. To lend a purposeful pattern of autobiographical writing, Bhutto pursues the mythos of autumn identified by Frye and constitutes her story with a beginning, middle and end persisting the autofiction with the conflict between good and evil. Bhutto purposefully designs her life events through mythmaking and self-invention. The prevalent motive in her autobiography is associated with the martyr cult of Shiite Imams. The severity of the loss she suffered made her view her father’s death as Shahadat (the martyrdom for the faith) and her mission of the restoration of democracy, which stemmed from her father, as a desire for shahadat (martyrdom). Bhutto glorifies the honour of the Bhutto family as an absolute family tradition, the part of the family milieu as a representation of the feudal system and mythologizes her struggle against the dictator as a notion of sacrifice for democracy.

#### **b) The Signification of Honour as an Absolute Family Tradition**

An autobiographer, for Renza, tries to impose on the reader a pervasive system of personal values (290). In *Daughter of the East* Bhutto another autobiographical motive is the presumption of honour as an absolute family tradition which, according to Bhutto, every Bhutto generation inherits from its ancestors. Like her brothers, she loved hearing those honour-related stories of the Bhutto family. Even her brothers, Mir Murtaza and Shah Nawaz were named after their ancestors. Their moral codes were formed by the adversities they faced as Zulfikar Ali Bhutto believed in the Bhutto moral code of “loyalty, honour, and principle” (27). He imprinted on her the rule of “Endurance. Honor. Principle”, which kept her going (97). This motive is part of the family milieu, a feudal and tribal system. *Daughter of the East* is a product of the creative memory by which the author redesigns her past events. Thus, the narration of her past is the outcome of the representation of the tales of her family and culture. Subsequently, the whole autobiographical project is undermined and its formal identity as a genre of nonfiction is likely to be unstable. Exciting the spell of inter-subjective and verbal conventions, Bhutto as a fiction-prone autobiographer outlaws the possibility of conceiving the fundamentally private knowledge of her experience and incorporates the tribal and cultural stories to glorify her present-oriented past. She develops the possibility of the signification of the past and makes an impression that the past under the narration is transparently available to the reader.

The purposefully orchestrated autobiography requires the reconstitution of the autobiographical self to be harmonized with the autobiographer’s intended goals. Bhutto’s impression of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto is of a staunch fighter who grappled with the cruelty and injustice that prevailed in the country. His wish to see

his people having equality and justice termed him the Huseinian who honours humanity and principles. He taught his people to stand against oppression and aimed to give equal status to the rich and the poor. She describes the struggle of her father against the feudal system of Pakistan that Muslims bow themselves before Allah Almighty while the poor people of Pakistan still bowed themselves before the feudal lords and the capitalists. Her father forbade the people to grovel before the rulers (35). The question arises of what makes Bhutto interpret her life narrative mythologically concerning the early history of Islam. Renza argues that an autobiographer's major interest is political and religious history and its values: "Politics and history become dominant realities for the imagination" (272). To acclaim political appreciation and populist support, Bhutto seeks the new air of the old memories and transcends the limitations of the genre to manipulate the image of her father as a political martyr.

The fictionalization of nonfiction via mythmaking proceeds with the recognition of Bhutto's mission of the restoration of democracy in her country and the mythologizing of such a mission is isolated from her private past yet she attempts to formulate it. Bhutto exhibits herself as the symbol of democracy and the responsibility for its restoration lays on her shoulders (Reconciliation: Islam, Democracy and the West 191). Bhutto interprets that it was a mystic experience of obtaining secret knowledge from her deceased father at the graveyard that she should stand up against the dictator, Zia ul Haq. The post-Zulfikar Ali Bhutto era, the Zia regime, was a nightmare for Pakistan, and she followed the objective set by her father. She says, "I had felt it as I stood by my father's grave, felt the strength and conviction of his soul replenishing me. At that moment I pledged to myself that I would not rest until democracy returned to Pakistan" (18). According to Renza, fictional and autobiographical protagonists pretend themselves contending against fate. This presumption of a contest against fate in the life narrative gives the form and power to the nonfictional genre (276). Instead of the objective narration of her past, the autobiographer abounds on her life writing about social, religious, and political values which isolate her from her personal and private history.

Bhutto associates the restoration of democracy with divine justice which can be viewed as the spiritualization of politics. She attempts to employ the literary narrative of fate, the protagonist aspiring against fate. The history of her life events – her memoir – is at the threshold of surmising a mythological Benazir Bhutto, a symbolic interpretation of the author's life. Bhutto combines historical and mythological knowledge to glorify her life narrative and the incidents of her family. She frames the death of her brother in the structure of Greek mythology: "He [her brother Shah Nawaz] looked like a sleeping Adonis. 'Gogi!' I shouted, trying to wake him up" (245). A fiction-prone autobiographer effectively spreads mythological streaks to constrict reality in this way (Renza 274). Bhutto expresses her vengeance further that she is Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's daughter and Shah Nawaz's sister. She challenges her rivals to meet her in the field of democratic practice (276). The autobiography proceeds like an invented story with the infusion of mythmaking and it is walled in the language, like a nunnery,

incongruously eliminating the sense of transparency. Bhutto's withdrawal from the lived life is a withdrawal from the facticity of his life.

### c) **The Autobiographical Benazir Bhutto: A Self-portrait of Oppression**

Bhutto develops a self-portrayal of oppression and lends allegorical meanings to her autobiographical narrative in which love (for her family), persecution and death are dramatically interpreted to validate her experiences and propagate her life events and political drives. While narrating her myth, she tries to examine her life references objectively to make the reader believe that it is a factual and straightened account of her story. This is what Olney means when he says that the autobiographer visualizes another person, another biosphere into existence (15). Being involved in her autobiographical dilemma of facing reality, Bhutto attempts to inhibit her past and narrate her present. The revolt against the political culture and ideology imposes fear upon her. To accomplish these drives, she converts the judicial trial and political struggle into a kind of personal myth. The fictive composition of *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography* recognizes that Bhutto has charged her memories. It is a book infiltrated with the problems and contradictions inherent in the concepts of author and self which reveals the writer's camouflaged past.

An autobiographer, for Renza, desires to colonize his autobiography in the name of literary art. The writer considers it appropriate to fictionalize his life events (273). The major impulse of her writing the autobiography was to make the world remember the persecution of the Bhutto family during the Zia regime (Bhutto 3). Bhutto seems nostalgic for the representational power of imaginative literature and narrates the judicial trial and hanging of her father in the murder case of Nawab Muhammad Ahmed Khan Kasuri (a local politician), as a political murder. She fictionalizes her autobiography and claims although her whole family was put under house arrest, the Zia regime could not shake her confidence. While writing, the autobiographer has undeniable authority to create and recreate his past the way he needs. The literary metaphors and images develop the story of the Bhutto woman, Benazir Bhutto and her mother into a pathetic tale of her courage and determination.

Memories and reality have a reciprocal relationship that determines the course of the autobiographical narrative to achieve present-oriented autobiographical goals (Olney 8). The cruelty of the martial law administrator General Zia, who tortured the Bhutto women in jail, converted it into public sympathy. Her father's martyrdom, the period of her imprisonment and her family's disrespect raised her to the status of a superhuman (Bhutto 212). The Bhutto family had been under arrest since the beginning of martial law. Both of the women were denied access to electricity, food, and water. She refers to the tragedy of Karbala that left the women of the holy clan stammered and bewildered after the martyrdom of Hazrat Imam Hussein (R.A.) (213). This is a characteristic of fiction writing not the nonfictional and transparent record of the author's life. This is a paranoid characteristic of her writing style which

associates every nightmare of her life with the supposed villain, Zia ul Haq.

Bhutto attempts to universalize her story in the fundamental paradigm of retribution and divine justice and claims that a tyrant does not remain forever and he is to be exterminated after all. She believes that she bore the tyranny of Zia's regime with firm faith and the day came on which there would be peace and harmony all around. She portrays the accidental death and subsequent downfall of the powerful military ruler (Gen. Zia ul Haq) as a divine punishment. Bhutto writes about her firm faith that Muslims bring up their children with the belief that Allah's wrath is great and descends instantly without any warning. The followers of the Bhutto family believe that Zia's accidental death was an example of Allah's wrath. It was horrible for the whole world to see (379). Bhutto represents herself as a winner of democracy in Pakistan. After the death of Zia, she victoriously hoped for the revival of democracy in the country. Whether she would win the election or lose it, she had won the opportunity to restore democracy to her country and, thus, her efforts were not in vain. She never compromised her principles (380). The autobiographer attempts to correlate her life history to the current occurrences to weave a complex net of present and past events and cast an impression that her autobiographical references are transparently available to the reader.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

Benazir Bhutto's *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography* reveals the mythologized and ghostly image of its autobiographer in the context of her present-future goals which invalidates her autobiographical claims of maintaining the factual account of her private past as an objective recapitulation of the lived life. This fragmentary, distorted and ghostly image of Benazir Bhutto signifies a mythological life as opposed to the life to be factually signified and the signification of the private past is removed from reality. Bhutto pursues the literary pattern of creative fiction using lofty imagery, mythological metaphors derived from the concepts of honour, martyrdom and the historical event of the Karbala tragedy and the Sindhi folktales to persuade her readers of the mythological interpretation as the factual orientation of her past through the tragically projected life events. The self-revelation of the personal experience in autobiography is the self-measuring of a person's progress. Hence, the journey of autobiographical writing from memorizing to mythologizing the personal facts, the formation of an elaborately constructed truth, fictionalizes the life references and portrays the autobiography as an endless prelude to the autobiographer's present and future, the unravished bride of imagination (a term coined by Renza) based on the veto of imagination.

#### REFERENCES

Abbas, Mujahid, and Asma Kashif Shahzad. "The Personal is Political: A Feministic Analysis of Pakistani Political Autogynographies." *University of Chitral Journal of Linguistics & Literature* 4.II (2021): 12-29.

Barthes, Roland, Fernande De George. "The Structuralists: From Marx to Lévi-Strauss." (1972): 155-78.

Bhutto, Benazir. *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography*. Simon and Schuster, 2014.

Bhutto, Benazir. *Reconciliation: Islam, Democracy and the West*. Simon and Schuster, 2014.

Bruss, Elizabeth W. *Autobiographical Acts: the Changing Situation of a Literary Genre*. Johns Hopkins Univ Pr, 1976.

Cox, James M. "Autobiography and America." *The Virginia Quarterly Review* 47.2 (1971): 252-277.

Das, Rochana. "Ethnicity in South Asia: India and Pakistan: A Comparative Study with Special Reference to Sindh and Assam." *Jadavpur Journal of International Relations* 1.1 (1995): 159-172.

Eakin, Paul John. *Fictions in Autobiography: Studies in the Art of Self-invention*. Princeton University Press, 2014.

Gusdorf, Georges. "Conditions and limits of autobiography." *Autobiography*. Princeton University Press, 2014. 28-48.

Khuuro, Amir Ahmed, and Ali Nawaz Soomro. "The Role of Benazir Bhutto in the Movement for the Restoration of Democracy: An Analysis." *International Journal of Social Science and Humanity* 3.3 (2013): 274.

Monnier, Brittany O'Dessa. "A Thematic Analysis of Three Women Elect: Their Life Stories Via Autobiography." (2016).

Olney, James. "Autobiography and the Cultural moment: A Thematic." *Historical, and Bibliographical Introduction.* Olney (1980): 3-27.

Renza, Louis. "The Veto of the Imagination: A Theory of Autobiography." *Autobiography: Essays Theoretical and Critical* (1980): 268-95.

Suh, Sarah. *Autobiography as Fiction, Fiction as Autobiography: A Study of Autobiographical Impulse in Pak Wansō's The Naked Tree and Who Ate Up All the Shinga*. Diss. 2014.

Suvorova, Anna. *Benazir Bhutto: A Multidimensional Portrait*. Karachi, Oxford University Press, 2015.

Yaqin, Amina. "Autobiography and Muslim Women's Lives." *Journal of Women's History* 25.2 (2013): 171-184.

#### AUTHORS

##### First Author – Mr. Asif Ali

Department of English Language and Literature, The University of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan  
Email: asifalinaseer@gmail.com

##### Second Author –Dr. Imran Hayat

Lecturer, Department of History & Arts, Division of Arts and Social Sciences, University of Education, Lower Mall Campus, Lahore, Pakistan

imran.hayat@ue.edu.pk,

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0647-0989>

##### Third Author –Dr. Muhammad Sajjad Malik

Assistant Professor, Department of History & Arts, Division of Arts and Social Sciences University of Education, Lower Mall Campus, Lahore, Pakistan, muhammad.sajjad@ue.edu.pk,  
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0883-5913>

##### Correspondence Author –Dr. Imran Hayat

Lecturer, Department of History & Arts, Division of Arts and Social Sciences, University of Education, Lower Mall Campus, Lahore, Pakistan, [imran.hayat@ue.edu.pk](mailto:imran.hayat@ue.edu.pk),

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0647-0989>

