

THE EVOLUTION OF GOOD GOVERNANCE USING THE INTERNET IN E-ADMINISTRATION AND E-GOVERNANCE

NOOR UL AIN USMANI¹, DR. MUSTAFA HYDER²

¹PhD Scholar, Department of Public Administration, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

²Assistant Professor, Department of Public Administration, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan.

Abstract

This is the e-century enriched with information technology bettering life many folds than ever. E-government is a gift of information technology, which is integral to every aspect of contemporary life. This technology can serve a variety of different ends: better delivery of government services to citizens, improved interactions with business and industry, citizen empowerment through access to information, or more efficient government management. Less corruption, improved transparency, greater convenience, income growth, and/or cost reductions may follow.

This paper wanted to explore how the internet and its services can play their role in governance and predict its importance and versatility in the shape of e-administration. Using the concept of modern administration and functional simplification the research proposes evidence in support of the argument that e-administration and e-governance are adding value to public sector service delivery and therefore should be preserved and enhanced when internet governance applications are implied. It also pays the attention to establishing the relationship between e-governance and e-administration and correlates each other with the help of different case studies within the context of Pakistani government sector organizations to illustrate modern administrative practices that include Pak Railway e-ticketing, Pakistan Post, and NADRA e-Sahulat.

Success is a journey, not a destination. This is applicable to governments also. With their emergence, information, and communication technologies (ICTs) have contributed to global expansion, growth, and possibilities. ICT has led to the creation of new dimensions of social and economic progress of governments and countries worldwide. The paper also investigates how ICTs and the Internet help to improve government effectiveness. Good governance is a transparent, accountable, and participatory way of governance. It seeks to make it possible for an organization to carry out its duties and achieve its objectives and is efficient and equitable in ensuring and supporting the rule of law as well as progress in the economic, social, and political realms of a country.

Keywords: e-governance, e-administration, modern administration, good governance, ICT.

Introduction

The phrase "e-governance" refers to the systems and processes that enable all electronic contacts between the government and its citizens, whether for information distribution, ballot casting, data gathering, or other purposes (Turner, Prasojo and Sumarwono, 2022). E-governance is the use of ICTs by the government to boost efficiency, improve transparency, and extend public engagement in decisions (Lavee and Cohen, 2019). Electronic democracy requires electronic involvement (e-participation), electronic consultation (e-consultation), and electronic control. The growing number of Pakistanis who use the internet demonstrates the country's eagerness to accept cutting-edge technologies. Citizens in Pakistan are keen to have access to the government's online e-services to enhance their everyday lives and maybe contribute to Pakistan's long-term growth and prosperity (Rehman et al. 2018). In October 2018, Pakistan's Prime Minister established the Pakistan Citizen's Portal to allow citizens to make recommendations and file grievances. As of the end of February 2019, almost half of the 420,000 complaints made via the site had good outcomes. The Pakistani government has established a five-year strategy to enhance the availability of financial services, with an emphasis on making digital transaction accounts more accessible and boosting the usage of digital payments. National and provincial efforts have been undertaken in the field of digital health. The World Health Organization and Pakistan's Federal Ministry of Health created NADRA e-Health cards, the immunization initiative (e-Vaccine), and the Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa governments.

Furthermore, it uses examples from Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa governments sector to demonstrate the link between e-government and E-bureaucracy, such as the e-ticketing systems at Pak Railway and Pakistan Post, as well as the e-Sahulat system at NADRA. The study's goal is to improve the understanding of Pakistan's ability to govern the internet. E-bureaucracy will also be examined for its relevance and adaptability in terms of effective governance, which includes the use of the internet, apps, and other electronic services Politicization has made it such that bureaucrats may no longer advance in their careers without requesting and receiving political favors such as postings, promotions, and transfers (Wilder, 2010). The bureaucracy's structure was dramatically transformed because of Bhutto's administrative reform. The CSP elite cadre was finally destroyed after being labeled as an "occupational group." The Basic Pay Scale replaced the previously utilized four-tiered categorization system for government employees (BPS). Grades 1-4 were for unskilled laborers, 5-15 for secretaries and administrative assistants, 16-22 for supervisors and police officers, and 17-22 for other professions (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021). As a result, strengthening civilian authority over the bureaucracy was a fundamental goal of the administrative changes of

1973. As a result, the amendment repealed the safeguards that had been in place for public officials under previous constitutions (Farida, 2021). The Election Commission of Pakistan coordinates and conducts elections for province and municipal government. According to Article 37 I, the government must be decentralized so that its business may be performed promptly and efficiently for the benefit of the people. This is because democracy is seen to sprout best at the local level. This idea is based on e-bureaucracy and the functional simplicity principle (Mansoor, 2021).

Wireless networks and internet-enabled mobile devices are also included in the definition of ICT (Portillo, 2020). Cutting-edge information and communication technology (ICT) components such as artificial intelligence (AI) and robots, as well as older but still frequently utilised technologies such as landline telephones, radio, and television transmission (Strużyna, 2021). As a result, persons looking for work in this industry should prepare for roles that need them to increase their digital literacy, data literacy, and usage of emerging technologies to enhance conventional modes of communication. To do so, we must investigate how augmented and virtual reality (VR) might enrich traditional forms of media and communication ideas (Portillo, 2020).

Types of E Governance

G2C (Government to Citizens) — Interaction between the government and the citizens.

By optimizing the process, a wide range of public services may be provided with minimal duplication of effort. Increases the breadth and efficiency of the government's public assistance services. The major purpose is to make government more accessible to the ordinary public (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021).

G2B (Government to Business):

The use of e-governance tools enhances the ability of the government to communicate with companies. Businesses will save time and money by reducing needless paperwork. Therefore, business contacts with the government will be streamlined. G2B efforts make several services more accessible, such as licensing, procurement: permit issuing, and tax collection (Lavee and Cohen, 2019).

G2G (Government to Government)

Government agencies may cooperate with minimal or no friction. This type of contact can take place between the federal and state governments, as well as between any two governments or even between individual states. The major objective is to boost efficiency, productivity, and output (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021).

G2E (Government to Employees)

Such discussions take happen between the government and its employees. Using ICT tools speeds up and improves these forms of communications, which boosts morale.

Businesses must include eCommerce into their strategy if they want to prosper in today's dynamic, interconnected global market. E-commerce has the potential to cut prices for customers owing to factors such as increased competition, cheaper expenses, and changes in vendor pricing methods as more businesses go online (Turner, Prasojo and Sumarwono, 2022). Businesses of all kinds, from sole proprietorships to Fortune 500 corporations, may profit from their own e-commerce website to sell their items online. Consumers of all ages today desire an easy and connected shopping experience that integrates perfectly with their busy lifestyles, thanks to the rapid development of new retail technology (Cohen and Aviram, 2021).

E Governance

The idea of E - Governance, upon which this explanation is founded, was developed by the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO). The use of information and communication technologies (ICTs) by governments and government agencies to better policymaking, service delivery, and public involvement is referred to as e-governance (Lavee and Cohen, 2019). The notion of electronic democracy (e-democratic) can be classified alongside that of electronic government (Hassan and Lee, 2019).

E Administration

The phrase "electronic administration" refers to a style of public administration that extensively depends on information and communication technology (ICT) to carry out its activities, with an emphasis on enhancing public relations, simplifying internal procedures, and communicating with other governments (Portillo, 2020). This means that the terms "electronic administration," "e-administration," and "electronic governance" are all interchangeable. Indeed, the emphasis here is on the use of ICT by the government in the delivery of public services. However, depending on the listener, the term "e-government" might indicate a multitude of things. The latter refers to making public records and services available to citizens in digital media, such as online (Mansoor, 2021). The process of improving public service delivery by leveraging the Internet and other kinds of electronic communication. The stakes in e-services are not so much the technology as they are a rethinking of the relationship between the state and its citizens. Improving citizen-government interactions and satisfying people's expectations necessitates extensive use of ICT (Strużyna, 2021).

Importance of E administration

E-services seek to increase the efficiency with which private and public sector organizations deliver their services to clients. It is also worth noting that programmed at this level are more narrowly focused on improving the government's own operations. Saving money, saving time, and managing how smoothly a process runs are all examples of how the "three Ps" of planning, monitoring, and controlling may help. This domain includes the efficacy of all available resources (human, monetary, and otherwise). E-administration strives to improve collaboration by building strong links between the numerous stakeholders in the administrative process, which in turn stimulates research, the creation of new policies, and their final implementation. This is seen in the ease with which authority and resources may be distributed because of this.

Hypothesis

- The purpose of this article is to investigate the relationship between electronic governance and electronic administration.
- To examine how E governance has influenced modern administrations.
- To look at how information and communication technologies (ICTs) and the Internet help to improve government effectiveness.

Methodology

Analyzing the case studies below can provide insight into phenomena. We may learn more about these phenomena by observing it for ourselves and developing our own judgments. The study obtains insight into the nature of e-governance services and the function of Internet governance in modern bureaucratic procedures by analyzing these cases. The source of a problem might be an individual, a group, or the entire system. Because of their expertise, researchers frequently concentrate on intrinsic occurrences. Therefore, their curiosity has been piqued. The emphasis in an instrumental case study shifts away from the instance itself and toward conceptualizing or redrawing larger generalizations. A collective case study is a study of numerous instances using the same instrument (Hassan, 2019) This investigation employs both an intrinsic and an instrumental case study technique. The goal is not just to detail the intricacies of this example, but also to demonstrate how it fits into larger patterns (Portillo, 2020). Second, you must understand the social, cultural, political, economic, legal, and artistic contexts in which the topic is being investigated. As a third point, being aware of such examples from which we might take insight is beneficial.

Case Studies

Case I - Pak Railway E-Ticketing

A user using an Android phone may now buy a train ticket anywhere in Pakistan in less than three minutes. When one first log in, one will be presented with six different screens: "Times," "Trips," "Fares," "Help," "Freight," and "Reviews." Customers may use the website to reserve one of 48 trains, learn about probable delays, anticipated arrival times, approved payment methods, and more. Mansoor, (2021) reported the usage of debit and credit card to purchase tickets online was more frequent than before.

- To purchase electronic tickets, a variety of financial exchanges can be employed.
- When a million of duplicate tickets have been provided, marking the first time in the 125-year history of Pakistan Railways that the government has opted to aggressively acquire duplicate tickets.
- Pakistan Railways is in trouble since the government's major measures have not resulted in the promised system improvements (Lavee and Cohen, 2019).

Pakistan Railways serves a vital purpose for the country by facilitating freight and passenger transportation to international standards (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021). There is a general lack of knowledge about the ticketing sector. To put it frankly, it is not really engaging. However, even in the domain of tickets, there are business lessons to be learned. Its economic implications have expanded to include bringing individuals from all around the country together. The introduction of computerized ticketing has helped Pakistan's transportation sector advance significantly. Long lengths of time spent in line and filling out papers are no longer beneficial to a student when they begin their educational journey (Mansoor, 2021). Furthermore, the e-ticketing service has not remedied the challenges that travelers have been experiencing while attempting to purchase train tickets. Business operations that can be completed totally online are not only the most efficient alternative, but they also frequently produce the best outcomes (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021). The online ticketing system of Pakistan Railways is an example of a corporation that has effectively utilized digital technologies. The Pakistan Railways system sold 10 million electronic tickets in a single year (Lavee and Cohen, 2019). Pakistan Railways has created an app called Pak Rail Live that allows users to track the whereabouts of trains in real time, regardless of where they are in the nation (Faedlulloh, 2021). Pakistan Railways has launched a new app, Pak Rail Live, to give passengers with real-time updates on the whereabouts of their trains. It monitors classrooms in real time and notifies participants of impending events, agenda items, and when they should arrive at

specified places. This is an excellent concept that would significantly improve people's lives. Customers may use their telephones in connection with the device to track the arrival time of the new educational center on their platform (Mansoor , 2021).

Pakistan Railways pays close attention to its passengers, doing its best to make the journey as smooth and inexpensive as possible with each passing day, and this is partly because the expansion of the national economy has been tied to a robust railway infrastructure (Mansoor, 2021). Smart applications, such as electronic tickets, may be readily tracked and used to offer rapid access to pertinent data. Users may access their bank accounts by using any ATM or credit card terminal on this network (Farida, 2021).

PR has developed a Marketing Directorate that reports directly to the Ministry of Railways to facilitate the launch of new commercial initiatives backed using excess Railway assets and capital investments produced purely from the private sector (Hassan, 2019)

Case 2: Pakistan Post

Pakistan Post offers a wide range of functions in addition to providing consumers and businesses with easy access to communication networks. (The Pakistan Post) Pakistan Post focuses on cutting-edge networking and IT infrastructure to adapt to the ever-changing communications market outside its traditional core postal operation. Using Pakistan Post to transfer money, mail, or goods is a safe, quick, and inexpensive choice. Pakistan Post has launched a completely new fast service with online monitoring and tracing capabilities (Idike et al., 2019). Customers may then trace their shipments through the postal service from anywhere on the planet. Meanwhile, the Postal Service is starting a new service that will allow users to pay a nominal charge to have their monthly utility bills deposited in their mailboxes. The postal service is now competitive with private couriers thanks to this new tracking technology. Private corporations must pay express mail charges, which are outlined below. More than 50 post offices in the United States offer express mail. Many Pakistanis would appreciate the ability to skip costly excursions to banks and post offices to make routine payments, especially considering the low cost of using this service (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021).

Across the country, postal services are accessible at approximately 13,000 sites. Pakistan Post provides free delivery services to about twenty million households and business enterprises. The Pakistan Post not only transports mail, but also collects a range of taxes and utility bills on behalf of the federal and provincial governments (including those for electricity, water, Sui Gas, and telephone service) (Meijer, Lorenz and Wessels, 2021). Postal services are only one part of the Pakistan Post

Office, which has grown to encompass postal life insurance, the Pakistan Post Savings Bank, and much more throughout the years. Its initial and maybe most important aim is letter delivery. Previously, Electronic Money Orders (also known as Post for Windows Payment System GPOs) were only available through GPOs (EMO). Pakistan Post has launched a new service that allows customers to send and receive electronic money orders (Cavalcante and Lotta, 2022).

Change is common in the postal delivery industry. Despite the continued collapse of the conventional industry, the company's management is being influenced by the exponential increase in parcel delivery led by e-commerce (Turner, Prasojo and Sumarwono, 2022). Pakistan Post is a trustworthy source of information regarding the country's evolving postal policy. Because of the emergence of online shopping, the package delivery business has witnessed parabolic expansion, and service providers are being pressured to keep up with consumers' ever-changing needs. Since the government is now active in national postal regulation, services are a helpful objective source on the issue. Although average mail volumes have decreased, the postal service has reported on the actions taken by authorities to guarantee the universal service remains financially sustainable. Preparing for future changes by studying other nations' political and judicial systems (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021).

Electronic money orders are sent to recipients via postal service and front door. Post-to-Post window payments are transmitted from the EMO to the associated GPO via the EMO. At the counters, money orders can be reserved. Money orders and the riposte quick transfer mechanism are also accepted. One may withdraw the monies quickly and simply at any GPO. The Transaction ID itself serves as the encryption key. Same-day delivery and electronic money orders are only two of the cutting-edge monetary services launched by Pakistan Post in recent years. By making postal services more widely available to the public at low or no cost, the department's clout in the field of computerized financial services has grown (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021). Pakistan Post also provides the UPU Universal Postal Service Network, which utilizes a wide range of people, procedures, technologies, and one-of-a-kind product offerings to ensure the secure and timely transportation of mail, money, and equipment at affordable pricing. Both Pakistan International Remittances and the Postal Mobile Application were created to address the evolving demands of the global communications sector. However, Pakistan Post's postal savings initiative is expected to accomplish more than only expand financial inclusion in the country; it is also expected to produce money for the postal service. (Lavee and Cohen, 2019)

Case 3: NADRA E Sahulat

NADRA e-Sahulat makes use of technology and new business opportunities to increase people's access to services, particularly in economically depressed areas (NADRA eSahulat). The e-mission of Sahulat is to make safe online commerce and payment processing a reality for both consumers and businesses (Meijer, Lorenz and Wessels, 2021). It serves as a hub for low-cost e-services offered online. E-Sahulat franchises are available on simple terms that are ideal for small firms and lone entrepreneurs. The franchisee will issue a credit equal to the initial deposit based on a prepaid model, which may be recharged at any time using regular banking procedures. The franchisee receives a royalty on each sale. Many businesses in Pakistan use franchise models to recover debts from clients across the country. E-Sahulat has built a centralized, quick, and automated billing system for utilities, postpaid, and telecom tower charges to better serve our business clients.

For the first time, E-Sahulat allows people in Pakistan to transact business online. This advancement has produced changes in the traditional way of bill paying. It enables clients to make payments outside of regular business hours when they are less likely to receive assistance in person at a bank or utility. As a result, difficulties in completing monthly bill payments have been alleviated. It paves the path for people to settle in congested, economically poor places. The Citizenship Verification System is available to the public and may be used to validate the information of citizens as required by law (Strużyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021). One may pay the utility bills regardless of where one is in the United States. However, some utilities enable clients to pay their payments from anywhere in the country. The e-Sahulat channels, which are manned by actual people, provide assistance. The crew has been educated and has made it a habit to provide exceptional service. Many POPs are free to e-Sahulat users, which will be particularly valuable as product circulation rises for participating firms. POPs would grow because of the development of e-Sahulat. These supplementary facilities are being built because of the expanding population and higher customer demands (Idike et al., 2019).

Because to NADRA's foresight in improving the e-Sahulat programmed, the agency is now collecting payments from clients at an unprecedented rate thanks to payment automation. Businesses may use the e-Sahulat system to make rapid, secure, and trustworthy payments that are immediately returned, making it easier to collect past-due sums. Due to its capacity to reconcile all transactions in one location, e online Sahulat outperforms traditional bill collection systems. Businesses can use their CSCs to establish e-Sahulat, a system that allows clients to pay their invoices online. (Meijer, Lorenz and Wessels, 2021)

Impact of Modern Administration in E Governance

First, the term "governance" must be defined. Governance includes both policymaking and enforcement in the public realm. As a result, bureaucracy must be used as a tool for both governance and execution. As a result, the term "governance" is used to describe how a person behaves under various political systems. Governance in economics, politics, and administration vary greatly. Its origins may be traced back to the capacity of distinct social groups to play complementary roles. Socialization, the public's role as an informed creator of political society, the government's executive impact, the bureaucracy's administrative component, financial institution regulation, and conflict resolution by the judicial administration are all necessary components of effective governance. Today's government is accountable for a broader range of tasks than ever before. The contemporary state is the principal vehicle for bringing about socioeconomic transition in countries through providing critical public services such as the postal system and public transportation in metropolitan areas, as well as keeping order, collecting taxes, and assuring people's safety.

Analysis

E-ticketing on the Pakistan Railway, e-mailing with the Pakistan Post and the Nadra e-Sahulat are examples of efforts to modernize Pakistan's bureaucratic institutions. After the difficulties have been prioritized, the research initiatives focus on the specifics of those problems. The goal of e-bureaucracy is to digitize and make available conventional information while also shifting existing government services to an electronic platform via the Internet.

In the conditions, using Mintzberg's taxonomy as an alternative to digitalization to lead e-government strategy has been proved to be useful. Second, this case study demonstrates how bureaucracy may expand; the government has established a system to handle people's interactions with e-government. As a result, we must rely on Mintzberg's taxonomy to establish the benefit of a system that simplifies administrative operations. E-cumbersome solutions, in striking contrast to the goal of decreasing bureaucracy, which was key to the establishment of e-government policies as part of the digitalization plan, consist of frameworks meant to assist already bureaucratic activities. (Meijer, Lorenz and Wessels, 2021)

The development of an automated system based on several e-services is an example of a system designed to automate current processes. If there is a problem with digitization in a particular location, it may be feasible to determine who or what is to blame by examining the regulations that govern the Internet (Mansoor, 2021). This enhances the quality of information given by citizens with the government as well as citizens' capacity to have their voices heard. The logic of functional

simplification and closure developed for digitalization allows for modern administrative automation as well as time savings for bureaucrats. To build efficient e-bureaucratic institutions, simpler information system processes are required, as proven by the widespread usage of e-services such as electronic ticketing, electronic mail, and e-Sahulat. As a result, while developing e-government systems, functional simplification of the e-bureaucratic type should be explored and implemented to enhance the stature of bureaucratic organizations rather than eliminate them. (Struzyna, Marzec and Bozionelos, 2021)

The broad use of digital services like as e-ticketing, e-mail, and e-Sahulat is designed to improve communication among the several government departments and agencies that are currently engaged in digitalization. The basis for this idea was a desire to simplify time-consuming administrative procedures. A lot of e-bureaucratic processes are required for effective internet governance, and this framework is frequently meant to streamline such procedures (Idike et al., 2019). A study of the underlying design decisions reveals that the current organizational structure may be simplified by using a web application that requires little infrastructure and can generate little conflict with established practices. Rather, the model predicts how individuals will react to the ability to obtain government information online. Although they recognize that the use of ICT may result in enhanced governance, they are concerned that the expenses of doing so would dissuade residents from fully utilizing the technology. Mansoor, (2019) rely heavily on ICT for education, therefore if it is made more affordable and accessible to them, they will have better access to government data and programmed (Cavalcante and Lotta, 2022). Although the relationship between information availability and public participation in government was limited, it did indicate that if individuals had better access to data, they would have a considerably bigger effect on decisions. The public's enthusiasm has surely been dampened by the late service announcement and the inconvenience of standing in line for tickets.

Conclusion

The Digital Governance Model is gaining political support as a solution to these difficulties since it enhances the state's digital sovereignty on a new knowledge and technology level while also promoting socio-political societal stability. e-Sahulat, the National Database and Registration Authority's online service, the Pakistan Postal Service, and the Pakistan Railways' online ticketing system are all excellent examples of contemporary government administration in action. In this case study, efficient Internet architecture and the e-bureaucratic system are given as examples of good e-governance. This contributes to increased company-wide, employee-wide, and inter-unit interdependence. Because no other institution can deal with these difficulties, citizens can only go to

one place for help. The modern bureaucracy is the outcome of a group of professional bureaucrats working together to simplify and standardize bureaucratic procedures to boost the organization's overall efficiency and effectiveness. Because the framework has already been laid, electronic governance can be deployed. Because of the exponential rate at which technology has grown since the beginning of the Internet, long-term planning is now more important than ever. To keep up with the quick rate of technological progress, a flexible approach is required (Hassan and Lee, 2019). Experts were required for this difficult task to better grasp the nature and requirements of the private territory to attract investment.

References

- Abdou, A.M. (2021) 'Good governance and COVID-19: The digital bureaucracy to response the pandemic (Singapore as a model)', *Journal of Public Affairs*, 21(4), p. e2656.
- Beeri, I., Uster, A. and Vigoda-Gadot, E. (2019) 'Does performance management relate to good governance? A study of its relationship with citizens' satisfaction with and trust in Israeli local government', *Public Performance & Management Review*, 42(2), pp. 241–279.
- Cavalcante, P. and Lotta, G. (2022) 'Are governance modes alike? An analysis based on bureaucratic relationships and skills', *International Journal of Public Administration*, 45(4), pp. 319–334.
- Cohen, N. and Aviram, N.F. (2021) 'Street-level bureaucrats and policy entrepreneurship: When implementers challenge policy design', *Public Administration*, 99(3), pp. 427–438.
- Faedlulloh, D., Yulianto, Y. and Karmilasari, V. (2021) 'A Structural and Mindset Bureaucratic Reform Agenda for Jokowi's Second Term', *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi dan Organisasi Bisnis & Birokrasi*, 27(2), pp. 67–76.
- Farida, I. and Lestari, A. (2021) 'Implementation of E-Government as a Public Service Innovation in Indonesia', *RUDN Journal of Public Administration*, 8(1), pp. 72–79.
- Hassan, M.H. and Lee, J. (2019) 'Policymakers' perspective about e-Government success using AHP approach: Policy implications towards entrenching Good Governance in Pakistan', *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy* [Preprint].
- Idike, A. *et al.* (2019) 'The practice of inclusive representation in Nigeria bureaucracy: The federal character principal experience', *Cogent Social Sciences*, 5(1), p. 1601545.
- Lavee, E. and Cohen, N. (2019) 'How street-level bureaucrats become policy entrepreneurs: the case of urban renewal', *Governance*, 32(3), pp. 475–492.
- Mansoor, M. (2021) 'Citizens' trust in government as a function of good governance and government agency's provision of quality information on social media during COVID-19', *Government Information Quarterly*, 38(4), p. 101597.
- Mansoor, M. (2021) 'Citizens' trust in government as a function of good governance and government agency's provision of quality information on social media during COVID-19', *Government Information Quarterly*, 38(4), p. 101597.
- Meijer, A., Lorenz, L. and Wessels, M. (2021) 'Algorithmization of bureaucratic organizations: Using a practice lens to study how context shapes predictive policing systems', *Public Administration Review*, 81(5), pp. 837–846.

- Monteiro, P. and Adler, P.S. (2022) 'Bureaucracy for the 21st century: Clarifying and expanding our view of bureaucratic organization', *Academy of Management Annals*, 16(2), pp. 427–475.
- Morçöl, G., Shafi, S. and Menon, A. (2022) 'Governance networks, bureaucracy, and democracy', *Perspectives on Public Management and Governance*, 5(2), pp. 84–96.
- Önder, M. and Zengin, Ü.N. (2022) 'A framework for comparative analysis: Public administration across the globe', in *The Palgrave Handbook of Comparative Public Administration*. Springer, pp. 51–76.
- Portillo, S., Bearfield, D. and Humphrey, N. (2020) 'The myth of bureaucratic neutrality: Institutionalized inequity in local government hiring', *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 40(3), pp. 516–531.
- Strużyna, J., Marzec, I. and Bozionelos, N. (2021) 'Competency Management in Bureaucratic Organizations: Evidence from the Polish Public Administration', *European Management Review*, 18(2), pp. 43–57.
- Suzuki, K. and Hur, H. (2020) 'Bureaucratic structures and organizational commitment: findings from a comparative study of 20 European countries', *Public Management Review*, 22(6), pp. 877–907.
- Turner, M., Prasajo, E. and Sumarwono, R. (2022) 'The challenge of reforming big bureaucracy in Indonesia', *Policy Studies*, 43(2), pp. 333–351.
- Williams, M.J. (2021) 'Beyond state capacity: bureaucratic performance, policy implementation and reform', *Journal of Institutional Economics*, 17(2), pp. 339–357.