EFFECT OF NEW CHEMISTRY INSECTICIDES DIRECTLY AND THROUGH POISONED MUSTARD APHIDS ON COCCINELLA SEPTEMPUNCTATA

Ghulam Yaseen¹, Muhammad Sufian^{1*}, Aadil Ali^{1,3}, Umer Liaqat^{1,2}, Muhammad Faisal Ul Rehman¹, Muhammad Hammad Shad¹, Amin Ullah³, Fatima Akbar², Ali Raza²

¹Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.
 ²Department of Zoology, Wildlife and Fisheries, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.
 ³Government of Balochistan, Agriculture & Cooperative Department, Pakistan.

ABSTRACT-Aphids are highly damaging insect pest of mustard crop that causes direct and indirect losses in many growing areas of Pakistan. In addition to insecticides, biocontrol agents, especially Coccinella septempunctata, play a significant role in managing aphid population. The consistent use of insecticides may directly and indirectly (through poisoned aphid) have significant effect on the Coccinella septempunctata. Keeping in view the importance the effect of new chemistry insecticides directly and through poisoned mustard aphid on development of Coccinella septempunctata were assessed in lab conditions. Under laboratory conditions, this experiment was conducted by using CRD layout with four replications of each treatment. Four different concentrations of insecticides (Flonicamid and Spirotetramat) were applied by direct application of pesticides on adults of C. septempunctata and indirectly through by feeding poisoned aphid to C. septempunctata. The mortality and consumption rate of poisoned aphids were counted after 24, 48 and 74 h of study period. Results showed that in case of direct application, the maximum mortality were recorded 58.75±0.25 and 51.50±0.28% after 72 h of treatment of Spirotetramat and Flonicamid @ 1500 and 150 ppm, respectively. In case of indirect application (through poisoned aphids), the maximum mean mortality percentage was noticed 36.00±1.2% with lowest consumption 70.66±2.62% after 72 h of study period by the treatment of Flonicamid @ 150 ppm conc. Similarly, the maximum mean mortality percentage 43.33±0.72% was noticed with lowest consumption rate of 49.33±2.65% after 72 h of study period by the application of Spitotetramat @ 1500 ppm. The Spirotetramat (50 EC) is considered more toxic than Flonicamid (50 wg). Furthermore, results showed that as consumption rate increases mortality decreases and consumption decreases mortality increases. In some cases, the feeding behavior remains asymptomatic. This study provides insight into the ecological consequences of using new chemistry insecticides and their implications for IPM strategies in agriculture.

Key words: aphids, *Coccinella septempunctata*, Flonicamid, insecticides, natural enemies, Spitotetramat

I. INTRODUCTION

The mustard Aphids (Hemiptera: Aphidoidae) are sap-sucking insect pests and cause severe damage to agro-crops in various areas of the world [1]. They are also considered as key pests of

mustard plant and mainly present in Pakistan, China, USA, India and Bangladesh [2, 3]. The nymph of mustard aphid as well as its adult heavily damages the plants by sucking the cell sap from leaf, badly affecting the inflorescence and consequently incomplete growth of pods which ultimately decline mustard yield [2]. Moreover, they also produced considerable amounts of honeydew which causes the growth of fungus and affects the photosynthetic activity of plants due to blackish appearance of pods and leaves [4]. It affects the quality of seed products and causes approximately 70-90 percent yield losses [5, 6]. Due to short life span, aphids have approximately forty generations annually mainly in optimal weather conditions, this means that billions of aphids produced annually by a female, if they are not properly managed [7]. Usually, to control aphids' various pesticides are used which not only affect the environment but, also non-targeted species [8]. The excessive use of pesticides to control aphids, the resistance development against insecticides was reported in many parts of the world [9].

Biological control agents belonging to the family Coccinellidae and Chrysopidae are the most active and cosmopolitan predators which feed on a wide range of insect pests including aphids. mealybugs, whiteflies, leafhoppers, and several other soft-bodied insects [10]. They were also found to feed on the eggs and newly hatched larvae of lepidopterans [11]. The ladybird beetle is considered the most important and successful predator of several pests attacking cotton, sunflower, citrus and vegetables crops [12, 13]. The seven spotted ladybird beetle is considered as the best natural enemies among the others as a valuable predatory insect of aphids. Both larvae and adults of seven spotted ladybird beetles not only feed on aphids, but they also feed on various soft body insects like scales, spider mites, borers, spider mites, mealy bug and eggs of various other pests [14]. The use of natural enemies to control pests provides an advantage to reduce the risks associated with insecticides. The ladybird beetle showed a greater performance to control pests by predation than other natural enemies as a biological control agent [15]. Moreover, it is reported that the ladybird beetle is greatly definite to aphid diet [16].

The biological agents and natural predators or parasites of aphids generally present in agro-ecosystem and usually subjected to insecticides directly during the foliar application [17], and indirectly through the interaction with insecticide residue on the

Journal of Xi'an Shiyou University, Natural Science Edition

leaves of plant or consuming poisoned prey [18, 19]. Similarly, natural enemies faced hazardous effects of insecticides, as feeding on nectars of flowers contaminated due to insecticide application and effected hosts [20]. In addition to direct mortality, insecticides may have sublethal effects on physiology, behavior, and biological parameters, including development time, longevity, fecundity, and fertility of beneficial arthropods [20-23]. For example, insect growth regulator hexaflumuron had significant effects on development duration, survival, pupation, and hatching of *C. septempunctata* [24]. Sublethal concentrations of imidacloprid reduced the fecundity of *C. septempunctata*, which could result in markedly lowering their populations [24, 25].

However, with the increasing demand for insecticides and their effects on the environment, it is necessary to find effective strategies to control the mustard aphids to minimize the effect of insecticides on non-targeted organisms and their environment. So, keeping in view study was conducted to find out the "effect of new chemistry insecticides directly and through poisoned mustard aphids on development of *Coccinella septempunctata*". This study provides insight into the ecological consequences of using new chemistry insecticides and their implications for IPM strategies in agriculture.

II. MATERIALS AND METHODS

The experiments were conducted under controlled conditions (at $25\pm2^{\circ}$ C temperature and the 60- 70% RH) in Biological Control Lab of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad.

Insect material:

The adult ladybird beetle (*Coccinella septempunctata*) was collected from a mustard field from Entomological research area at Young-Wala and were reared in Biological Control laboratory, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad. The predator was reared on aphids in small plastic transparent boxes. Honey solutions were also provided in cages with the help of cotton wicks and newly laid eggs were collected and placed in plastic boxes (90 mm) after hatching, the larvae were provided with aphids inside the boxes. The culture was maintained until there were homogenous populations obtained for the experiment [14].

Aphid:

The aphid population was also collected from different fields of Entomological research area, at Young-Wala and were maintained in biological control laboratory, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad. The fresh leaves were provided to aphids in plastic boxes ($8.5 \times 6.5 \times 3.5$ inches) and leaves were replacing after every 24 hours. The culture was maintained until there was enough population for the experiment.

Bioassay

The bioassay was performed using pesticides directly on adults and larvae of *C. septempunctata* and indirectly through by feeding poisoned aphid to *C. septempunctata* [26]. The effects of new chemistry insecticides were tested using contact toxicity (direct exposure of lady bird beetles) and stomach poisoning (by providing poisoned aphids). Under CRD design, there were four treatments with replicated four times. The two new chemistry insecticides Flonicamid at the concentrations (0, 18.5, 37.5, 75 and 150 ppm) and Spirotetramat at the concentrations (0, 187, 375, 750 and 1500 ppm) were applied directly and indirectly through poison aphids under laboratory conditions. At first the direct effect of insecticides was tested by a direct application method. In second, case the aphids pretreated with different concentrations of both insecticides and were feed to *C. septempunctata*. The mortality and survival rate were recorded after 24, 48 and 72 hours of feeding. Percentage pray consumption was counted by counting left over numbers of aphids divided into the given numbers of aphids multiply by hundred. Survival of *C. septempunctata* was considered successful when larvae developed to adults.

Statistical analysis

The data was subjected to complete random design for ANOVA table. The all-pair wise meaning was calculated using Tuckey HSD test. The significant differences were recorded. The percentage mortality was calculated using mortality formula and lethal concentration (LC50) were calculated using Probit analysis.

III. RESULTS:

Direct exposure of *Coccinella septempunctata* to Flonicamid (50 wg)

The results showed that the direct application of Flonicamid different concentrations had significant effect on the survival of seven spotted ladybird beetles (*Coccinella septempunctata*) after 24 h of treatments ($F_{=1104.07}$, df=4,19, p<0.05, LC₅₀=14.925). The highest percentage mortality was recorded 26.00±0.40% after direct treatment of Flonicamid at the rate of 150 ppm, which was not significantly different for treatments T3 and T2, respectively. The lowest mortality percentage was recorded 8.75±0.25% after treatment of Flonicamid @ 18.5 ppm (Fig. 1).

The results showed that the direct application of Flonicamid (LC₅₀=18.567) at various concentrations significantly affect the seven spotted ladybird beetle (*C. septempunctata*) after 48 h of treatments (F=_{2679.63}, df=4,19, p<0.05). The maximum percentage mortality of seven spotted ladybird beetles were recorded (36.50±0.28%) after treatment of Flonicamid @ 150 ppm, followed by 33.75 ± 0.47 , 21.50 ± 0.25 and $18.00\pm0.28\%$ after treatment of Flonicamid at the rate of 75, 37.5 and 18.5 ppm concentrations, respectively (Fig. 1).

The direct application of Flonicamid (LC₅₀=24.209) at different concentrations significantly affect the seven spotted ladybird beetle (*C. septempunctata*) as compared to control after 72h of treatments ($F_{=4580.66}$, df=4,19, p<0.05). The maximum percentage mortality was recorded 51.50±0.28% after the treatment of Flonicamid @ 150 ppm, which was not significantly different from treatment T2 (Flonicamid @ 75 ppm). There was 0.25±0.25% percent mortality was recorded in control group; this mortality may be due to change in lab condition or contaminations (Fig. 1).

Direct exposure of *Coccinella septempunctata* to Spirotetramat (50 EC)

The results showed that the direct application of Spirotetramat different concentrations had significant effect on the survival of seven spotted ladybird beetles (*C. septempunctata*) as compared to control after 24 h of treatments ($F_{=819.69}$, df=4,19, p<0.05, LC_{50} =14.177). The highest percentage mortality was recorded 28.00±0.4% after treatment of Spirotetramat at the rate of1500 ppm conc. which was not significantly different from other treatments. The percentage mortality was recorded 25.50±0.25, 18.75±0.40 and 10.00±0.40% after treatment of Spirotetramat @ 750, 375 and 187 ppm concentrations, respectively. There was no percentage of mortality recorded in control (Fig. 2).

The direct application of Spirotetramat various concentrations had significant effect on survival of *C. septempunctata* after 48 h of

treatments (F_{=1549.46}, df=4,19, p< 0.05, LC₅₀=15.056) (Fig 2). The maximum mean percentage mortality of were recorded (41.0±0.40%) after treatment of Spirotetramat at the rate of 1500 ppm, which was significantly different from other treatments. The lowest mean percentage mortality was recorded 18.25±0.40% after treatment of Spirotetramat @ 187 ppm. No mortality was recorded in control.

The results exhibited that the direct application of Spirotetramat different concentrations had significant effect on survival of *C. septempunctata* after 72 h of treatments ($F_{=8497.20}$, df=4,19, p<0.05, LC₅₀=27.977) (Fig. 2). The highest mean percentage mortality was recorded as 58.75±0.25% and minimum mortality was noticed as 33.00±0.40% after treatment of Spirotetramat at the rate of 1500 and 187 ppm, respectively.



Figure 1: Effect of direct application of different concentrations of Flonicamid (50 wg) on *Coccinella septempunctata* after different intervals of time during the experimental period. Means with standard error and homogeneous group are present, same lowercase letters are not statistically different from each other at Tukey HSD test (p<0.05).



Figure 2: Effect of direct application of different concentrations of Spirotetramat (50 EC) on *Coccinella septempunctata* after different intervals of time during the experimental period. Means with standard error and homogeneous group are present, same lowercase letters are not statistically different from each other at Tukey HSD test (p<0.05).

Indirect effect of Flonicamid on *Coccinella* septempunctata through poison aphids

The results of the experiment indicated the indirect effect of Flonicamid (through poisoned aphids) on Coccinella septempunctata after various intervals of feeding period. The consumption rate was not significantly different from each other (Table 1). The consumption rate was not significant different from each other at Tukey HSD test. The mean maximum consumption of poisoned aphids was recorded 73±0.94% with lowest mean percentage mortality 4.00±0.81% after treatment of Flonicamid @ 18.5 ppm (df=4,19, p=0.2837) (Table 1). Similarly, the lowest mean consumption was recorded 63±1.25% with high mortality rate of 12.00±0.25% after treatment at the rate of 150 ppm of Flonicamid concentration. After 48 h of experimental period the maximum mean consumption was noticed as 75±1.30% with minimum mean mortality rate of 6.00±0.27% after treatment of Flonicamid @ 18.5 ppm (df= 4,19, p=0.7941). The minimum consumption was recorded 59±2.62% with maximum mean mortality $21.67\pm0.27\%$ (Table 1). Similarly, the highest mean consumption of position aphids was noticed as $85.66\pm1.30\%$ with lowest mean percentage mortality $12.67\pm0.91\%$ and lowest consumption was recorded $70.66\pm2.62\%$ with maximum mean mortality percentage 36.00 ± 1.2 after 72 hours of study period (df=4,19, p=0.5437, Table 1). The mortality rate of *Coccinella septempunctata* had an indirect relationship with consumption rate, as consumption rate increased mortality decreased vice versa.

Indirect effect of Spirotetramat on *Coccinella septempunctata* through poison aphids

The results of the experiment indicated the indirect effect of Spirotetramat (through poisoned aphids) on *Coccinella septempunctata* after different intervals of feeding period. The consumption rate was not significantly different from each other's Tukey HSD test (Table 2). The mean maximum consumption of poisoned aphids after 24 h of feeding period was recorded $85.25\pm0.94\%$ with lowest mean percentage mortality $6.67\pm0.27\%$ after treatment of Spirotetramat @ 187 ppm (df= 4,19, p=0.5437) (Table 1). Similarly, the lowest mean consumption was recorded $59.75\pm0.85\%$ with high mortality rate of $14.67\pm0.27\%$ after treatment of Spirotetramat at the rate of 1500 ppm concentration.

Journal of Xi'an Shiyou University, Natural Science Edition

After 48 h of experimental period the highest mean consumption was noticed as $77.75\pm1.89\%$ with minimum mean mortality rate of $7.66\pm0.27\%$ after treatment of Spirotetramat @ 187 ppm (df= 4,19, p=0.5732). The minimum consumption was recorded 69.25±2.5% with maximum mean mortality 25.67±0.72%, as compared to control (Table 2). Similarly, the highest mean consumption of position aphids was noticed as $87.66\pm0.85\%$ with lowest mean percentage mortality $11.33\pm0.27\%$ and lowest consumption was recorded $49.33\pm2.65\%$ with maximum mean mortality percentage $43.33\pm0.72\%$ after 72 hours of study period (df= 4,19, p=0.6567, Table 2). The *C. septempunctat* significantly consumed poison aphids mainly treated with lower concentrations of both insecticides. The mortality rate of *Coccinella septempunctata* had an indirect relationship with consumption rate, as consumption rate increases mortality decreases and consumption decreases mortality increases. In some cases, the feeding behavior of seven spotted ladybird beetles remains asymptomatic.

Table 1: Mean consumption and mean mortality percentage of seven *Coccinella septempunctata* treated with different concentrations of Flonicamid after 24, 48 and 72 hours of feeding interval.

| Treatments (ppm) | Daily consumption (mean ± S.E) | | | | | | | |
|---------------------|--------------------------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------|--------------------|------------------|--|--|
| | 24 h | | 48 h | | 72 h | | | |
| | Consumption (%) | Mortality (%) | Consumption (%) | Mortality (%) | Consumption (%) | Mortality (%) | | |
| 150 | 63±1.25b | 12.00±0.25a | 59±2.62c | 21.67±0.27a | 70.66±2.62 | 36.00±1.2a | | |
| 75 | 68±0.91b | 9.00±0.51b | 62±3.14bc | 16.00±0.25ab | 78.66±3.14b | 26.67±0.54b | | |
| 37.5 | 69±0.85b | 9.00±0.25b | 67±4.17bc | 15.33±0.33b | 80.33±4.17b | 22.33±0.54c | | |
| 18.5 | 73±0.94ab | 4.00±0.81c | 75±1.30ab | 6.00±0.27c | 85.66±1.30bc | 12.67±0.91d | | |
| Control | 91±0.75a | 00±0.00d | 93±0.83a | 00±0.00d | 93.33±0.83a | 00±0.00e | | |
| p-value | 0.2837 | 0.000 | 0.7941 | 0.000 | 0.5437 | 0.000 | | |

Means with standard error and homogeneous group are present in the table, same lowercase letters are not statistically significant form each other at Tukey HSD test (p<0.05).

Table 2: Mean consumption and mean mortality percentage of seven *Coccinella septempunctata* treated with different concentrations of Spirotetramat after 24, 48 and 72 hours of feeding interval.

| Treatments (ppm) | Daily consumption (mean ± S.E) | | | | | | | |
|---------------------|--------------------------------|---------------|--------------------|---------------|--------------------|---------------|--|--|
| | 24 h | | 48 h | | 72 h | | | |
| | Consumption (%) | Mortality (%) | Consumption (%) | Mortality (%) | Consumption (%) | Mortality (%) | | |
| 1500 | 59.75±0.85b | 14.67±0.27a | 69.25±2.5b | 25.67±0.72a | 69.33±2.65d | 43.33±0.72a | | |
| 750 | 61.25±1.65b | 12.33±0.27b | 68.00±1.82b | 20.33±0.27b | 75.00±1.18c | 34.00±0.47b | | |
| 375 | 64.00±0.91b | 8.66±0.25c | 64.00±2.16b | 17.67±0.72b | 82.33±1.49bc | 24.67±0.54c | | |
| 187 | 85.25±0.94ab | 6.67±0.27d | 77.75±1.89ab | 7.66±0.27c | 87.66±0.85ab | 11.33±0.27d | | |
| Control | 88.00±0.91a | 00±0.0e | 90.00±1.29a | 00±0.0d | 93.66±0.75a | 00±0.0e | | |
| p-value | 0.5437 | 0.000 | 0.5732 | 0.000 | 0.6567 | 0.000 | | |

Means with standard error and homogeneous group are present in the table, same lowercase letters are not statistically significant form each other at Tukey HSD test (p<0.05).

IV. DISCUSSION

Journal of Xi'an Shiyou University, Natural Science Edition

The current study showed that, in case of direct application of insecticides on adults of Coccinella septempunctata, the mean maximum mortality was recorded 58.75±0.25 and 51.50±0.28% after the application of Spirotetramat and Flonicamid, respectively. The higher mortality was noticed in the case of Spirotetramat as compared to Flonicamid in all the experimental groups. The present study agreement with Bushsal et al. ([26] proposed that Flonicamid had the lowest impact on C. septempunctat as compared to Imidacloprid, Nitenpyram, Azadirachtin and Dimethoate, respectively, when ladybird beetles provided with treated Aphis fabae. Similarly, Jalali et al. ([27] stated that the Flonicamd are part of bio-rational insecticides did not show harmful impact on two spotted ladybird beetles as treated with 10 times higher concentration from of field recommended dose, this may be due to species difference. However, the current study contradicts with Azod et al. [28] who reported that Spirotetramat is considered less lethal than abamectin, but it can alter the pre-oviposition period, percentage of adult emergence and growth of Cheilomenes sexmaculata, however, species different from current studies. Similarly, Tengfei et al. [29] reported that the Spirotetramat did not affect the Coccinella septempunctata when applied through contact, there was no change in physiology and behavior was observed after different treatments. He also stated that Spirotetramat is considered safer for the natural enemies and other beneficial arthropods. Similar findings suggested that there was no hazardous impact noticed in adult and larvae of Adalia bipunctata after the treatments of Spirotetramat various concentrations [23]. Likewise, Planes et al. [30] proposed that survivorship, hatching potential, egg laying, longevity and fecundity were not changed after the treatment of Spirotetramat. However, the current study disagreed with Pezzini and Koh, [31] who reported that the high mortality was recorded in pirate bugs after the treatment of Flonicamid. Furthermore, he suggested that the Flonicamid insecticide effects insect pests both ingesting and contact with contaminated surface, thus the effect of this pesticide on the true bugs and ladybird beetle could be because of together impact of contact as well as due to ingestion of pesticide treated aphids, as providing green bean aphids and through substrate contact. The Pan et al. [32] stated that the different concentrations of Spirotetramat were used to manage the whiteflies and aphids due to its long-lasting impact and consider safest to natural enemies.

The present study proposed that maximum consumption was recorded in control as compared to treatments. The *C. septempunctat* significantly consumed poison aphids mainly treated with lower concentrations of both insecticides. The mortality rate of *Coccinella septempunctata* had an indirect relationship with consumption rate, as consumption rate increases mortality decreases and consumption decreases mortality

increases. In some cases, the feeding behavior of seven spotted ladybird beetles remains asymptomatic. The current study was agreement with Afza *et al.* [33] proposed that during the experiment period the seven spotted ladybird beetle was provided with both choice and free choice to feed aphids, the results showed that the *Coccinella septempunctata* mainly chose untreated aphids as compared to treated aphids in lab conditions. He also suggested that the seven spotted ladybird beetle consume more aphids treated with half of the field recommended dose as compared to full dose treatment. Singh *et al.* [34] proposed that half of the field recommended harmful to ladybird beetles while its impact was not detrimental.

The maximum consumption with lowest mortality was noticed when aphids treated with Flonicamid as compared to Spirotetramat. The mortality rate of Coccinella septempunctata had an indirect relationship with consumption rate, as consumption rate increases mortality decreases and consumption decreases mortality increases. In some cases, the feeding behavior of seven spotted ladybird beetles remains asymptomatic. The present study agreement with El-Zahi et al. [35] suggested that Flonicamid is considered safest insecticide in field condition as compared to imidacloprid and thiamethoxam. Hautier et al. [36] also suggested that flonicamid is considered safer than predatory insects that other applied insecticides in filed condition as compared to laboratory conditions. In contrast, Pezzini and Koh [31] proposed that the high mortality in C. septempunctata occurred due to ingestion of poison aphids as well as due to contact with surface, because Flonicamid produced toxicity both contact and ingestion method.

The *C. septempunctat* significantly consumed poison aphids mainly treated with lower concentrations of both insecticides. The current study agreement with Tengfei *et al.* [29] suggested that the *Coccinella* septempunctata significantly consumed treated prey such as camellia aphids explore to various concentrations of different insecticides. He further suggested that among the other insecticides treated aphids, the seven spotted ladybird beetle significantly consume camellia aphids explore to Spirotetramat different concentrations as compared to other groups of insecticides. This showed that the Spirotetramat has low lethality as compared to flonicamid. Similarly, Planes *et al.*, [30] reported that the Spirotetramat showed sub-lethal impact on mealybug destroyer ladybird beetle. He proposed that the Spirotetramat is considered harmless against the mealy bug destroyer lady beetle when exploring insecticide using prey.

Moreover, the combined direct and indirect impacts of new chemistry insecticide highlight the need for a general approach to pest management. These insecticides may significantly reduce the pest population, however, their impact on natural enemies must be carefully evaluated to avoid ecological balance disruption. Understanding the interactions among aphids, natural enemies and insecticides application can update strategies that promote IPM, like in time applications of insecticides to decrease exposure of natural enemies during critical life stages and application of ecofriendly insecticides could mitigate the adverse effects of insecticides on beneficial insects. It was concluded from the current study that the Spirotetramat (50 EC) is considered more toxic than Flonicamid (50 wg). The Spirotetramate (50 EC) showed a high mortality percentage when directly applied to adult seven spotted ladybird beetles as compared to Flonicamid. However, *Coccinella septempuncata* consumed more aphids treated with different concentrations of Spirotetramat as compared to treated aphids with flonicamid different concentrations. Thus, the current study showed that Flonicamid can be recommended for the use in field conditions as it was not harmful for the natural enemies as like that of Spirotetramat. The mortality rate of *C. septempuncata* is not too high to consider lethal, so, both pesticides can be used in IPM strategies.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to thank all the people who supported me in my research work and data collection.

VI. REFERENCES

- 1. Blackman, R.L. and V.F. Eastop, *Aphids on the world's herbaceous plants and shrubs, 2 volume set.* 2008: John Wiley & Sons.
- Sahoo, S., Incidence and management of mustard aphid (Lipaphis erysimi Kaltenbach) in West Bengal. The Journal of Plant Protection Sciences, 2012. 4(1): p. 20-26.
- Biswas, G., Efficacy of some plant materials against the mustard aphid, Lipaphis erysimi (Kalt.). Journal. Asiat. Soc. Bangladesh Sci, 2008. 34(1): p. 79-82.
- 4. Awasthi, V., *Introduction to general and applied entomology*. 2016: Scientific Publishers.
- 5. Razaq, M., et al., Losses in yield and yield components caused by aphids to late sown Brassica napus L., Brassica juncea L. and Brassica carrinata A. Braun at Multan, Punjab (Pakistan). Pak. J. Bot, 2011. **43**(1): p. 319-324.
- 6. Ali, M., A. Ali, and S. Hussain, *Predatory potential of Coccinella undecimpunctata L.(Coleoptera, Coccinellidae) on Aphis craccivora Koch.(Hemiptera, Aphididae) in Ladakh, India.* Entomon, 2024. **49**(3): p. 447-452.
- 7. Dedryver, C.-A., A. Le Ralec, and F. Fabre, *The conflicting relationships between aphids and men: a review of aphid damage and control strategies.* Comptes rendus biologies, 2010. **333**(6-7): p. 539-553.
- 8. Sadlo, S. and E. Szpyrka, *Ecotoxicological view of protection of apple orchards against insect pests in Poland*. Pestycydy, 2009(1-4): p. 15-26.
- 9. Herron, G.A. and L.J. Wilson, *Neonicotinoid resistance in Aphis gossypii glover (Aphididae: Hemiptera) from Australian cotton.* Australian Journal of Entomology, 2011. **50**(1): p. 93-98.
- 10. Bahy El-Din, I., *Studies on the biology and feeding capacity of some coccinellid species*. Unpublished M. Sc.

Thesis, Fac. of Agric., Moshtohor Benha Univ., Egypt, 2006.

- 11. Farag, N., T. Abd El-Wahab, and A. Abdel-Moniem, *The influence of some honeybee products as a diet substitute on the different stages of Coccinella undecimpunctata L. in Egypt.* Archives of Phytopathology and Plant Protection, 2011. **44**(3): p. 253-259.
- 12. Naveed, M., A. Salam, and M.A. Saleem, Contribution of cultivated crops, vegetables, weeds and ornamental plants in harboring of Bemisia tabaci (Homoptera: Aleyrodidae) and associated parasitoids (Hymenoptera: Aphelinidae) in cotton agroecosystem in Pakistan. Journal of Pest Science, 2007. **80**: p. 191-197.
- 13. Saeed, S., et al., Insecticidal control of the mealybug Phenacoccus gossypiphilous (Hemiptera: Pseudococcidae), a new pest of cotton in Pakistan. Entomological Research, 2007. **37**(2): p. 76-80.
- 14. Sarwar, M. and S.M. Saqib, *Rearing of predatory seven* spotted ladybird beetle Coccinella septempunctata L.(Coleoptera: Coccinellidae) on natural and artificial diets under laboratory conditions. Pakistan Journal of Zoology, 2010. **42**(1).
- Afza, R., et al., Effect of intra-guild predation and sub lethal concentrations of insecticides on the predation of coccinellids. Pakistan Journal of Zoology, 2019. 51(2): p. 611.
- Hodek, I. and A. Honêk, *Ecology of coccinellidae*. Vol. 54. 2013: Springer Science & Business Media.
- 17. He, F., et al., Compatibility of chlorantraniliprole with the generalist predator Coccinella septempunctata L.(Coleoptera: Coccinellidae) based toxicity, life-cycle development and population parameters in laboratory microcosms. Chemosphere, 2019. **225**: p. 182-190.
- 18. Torres, J.B. and J.R. Ruberson, *Toxicity of thiamethoxam* and imidacloprid to Podisus nigrispinus (Dallas)(Heteroptera: Pentatomidae) nymphs associated to aphid and whitefly control in cotton. Neotropical Entomology, 2004. **33**: p. 99-106.
- 19. Biondi, A., et al., Using organic-certified rather than synthetic pesticides may not be safer for biological control agents: selectivity and side effects of 14 pesticides on the predator Orius laevigatus. Chemosphere, 2012. **87**(7): p. 803-812.
- 20. Moscardini, V.F., et al., Sublethal effects of insecticide seed treatments on two nearctic lady beetles (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae). Ecotoxicology, 2015. 24: p. 1152-1161.
- 21. Desneux, N., A. Decourtye, and J.-M. Delpuech, *The sublethal effects of pesticides on beneficial arthropods*. Annu. Rev. Entomol., 2007. **52**(1): p. 81-106.
- 22. Papachristos, D.P. and P.G. Milonas, Adverse effects of soil applied insecticides on the predatory coccinellid Hippodamia undecimnotata (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae). Biological Control, 2008. **47**(1): p. 77-81.
- 23. Depalo, L., et al., *Lethal and sub-lethal effects of four insecticides on the aphidophagous coccinellid Adalia bipunctata (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae).* Journal of economic entomology, 2017. **110**(6): p. 2662-2671.

- 24. Yu, C., et al., Impact of imidacloprid on life-cycle development of Coccinella septempunctata in laboratory microcosms. Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety, 2014. **110**: p. 168-173.
- 25. Xiao, D., et al., Sublethal effects of imidacloprid on the predatory seven-spot ladybird beetle Coccinella septempunctata. Ecotoxicology, 2016. 25: p. 1782-1793.
- 26. Bhusal, B., S. Aryal, and I.P. Gautam, Selection of chemical pesticide to minimize toxic effect to ladybird beetle [Coccinella septempunctata Linn (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae)] while managing black bean aphid [Aphis fabae Scop.(Hemiptera: Aphididae)]. Nepal Agriculture Research Journal, 2023. **15**(1): p. 33-45.
- 27. Jalali, M.A., et al., *Toxicity of selected insecticides to the two-spot ladybird Adalia bipunctata*. Phytoparasitica, 2009. **37**: p. 323-326.
- 28. Azod, F., S. Shahidi-Noghabi, and K. Mahdian, *The impact of the pesticides abamectin and spirotetramat on biological parameters of the coccinellid predator Cheilomenes sexmaculata (Fabricius) via egg exposure.* Pistachio and Health Journal, 2019. **2**(1): p. 62-70.
- 29. Tengfei, L., et al., Sublethal effects of four insecticides on the seven-spotted lady beetle (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae). Journal of Economic Entomology, 2019.
 112(5): p. 2177-2185.
- 30. Planes, L., et al., *Lethal and sublethal effects of spirotetramat on the mealybug destroyer, Cryptolaemus montrouzieri.* Journal of Pest Science, 2013. **86**: p. 321-327.
- 31. Pezzini, D.T. and R.L. Koch, *Compatibility of flonicamid* and a formulated mixture of pyrethrins and azadirachtin with predators for soybean aphid (Hemiptera: Aphididae) management. Biocontrol Science and Technology, 2015. **25**(9): p. 1024-1035.
- 32. Pan, Y., et al., Contribution of cytochrome P450 monooxygenase CYP380C6 to spirotetramat resistance in Aphis gossypii Glover. Pesticide biochemistry and physiology, 2018. **148**: p. 182-189.
- 33. Afza, R., M.A. Riaz, and M. Afzal, Sublethal effect of six insecticides on predatory activity and survival of Coccinella Septempunctata (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae) following contact with contaminated prey and residues. Gesunde Pflanzen, 2020. **72**(1).
- 34. Singh, S.R., et al., Consumption rates and predatory activity of adult and fourth instar larvae of the seven spot ladybird, Coccinella septempunctata (L.), following contact with dimethoate residue and contaminated prey in laboratory arenas. Biological Control, 2004. **30**(2): p. 127-133.
- El-Zahi, E.-Z.S., E.-S.A. El-Sarand, and G.N. El Masry, Activity of flonicamid and two neonicotinoid insecticides against Bemisia tabaci (Gennadius) and its associated predators on cotton plants. Egyptian Academic Journal of Biological Sciences. A, Entomology, 2017. 10(8): p. 25-34.
- 36. Hautier, L., et al., Building a selectivity list of plant protection products on beneficial arthropods in open field: a clear example with potato crop. IOBC WPRS BULLETIN, 2006. **29**(10): p. 21.

First Author – Ghulam Yaseen, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.

Second Author – Muhammad Sufian, Associate Professor, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.

Third Author – Aadil Ali, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.

Fourth Author – Umer Liaqat, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.

Fifth Author – Muhammad Faisal Ul Rehman. Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.

Sixth Author – Muhammad Hammad Shad, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.

Seventh Author – Amin Ullah, Government of Balochistan, Agriculture & Cooperative Department, Pakistan.

Eighth Author – Fatima Akbar, Department of Zoology, Wildlife and Fisheries, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.

Ninth Author – Ali Raza, Department of Zoology, Wildlife and Fisheries, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan 38040.

*Corresponding author: Muhammad Sufian, Associate professor, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, 38040,

*Corresponding Co-author: Umer Liaqat, Research Associate, Department of Entomology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, 38040,